Memorandum of Opposition

A 8349/S 5612-A

Honorable Sean Ryan
Member of Assembly
540 LOB
Albany NY 12278

Honorable Pete Harckham
Senator
812 LOB
Albany, NY 12247

March 10, 2020

Dear Assemblyman Ryan and Senator Harckham:

The Empire State Forest Products Association has concerns with A.8349/S.5612-A relating to the classification of freshwater streams. If enacted, this bill would add all class C waterways to the list of additional protections for streams under the Protection of Waters Regulatory Program within the New York State Department of Environmental Conservation (DEC). We have most recently learned that this statutory change could impose permit windows which could be devastating to forest management in New York.

Currently class C streams are regulated by DEC and have a best usage classification for fishing. Class C waters are suitable for fishing and primary and secondary contact recreation, although certain naturally occurring factors may limit the use for these purposes. Class C waters can, by regulation, can have an additional T classification added to them which does add them to the Protection of Waters Regulatory Program.

Extending the added requirements to all class C streams by statute will add every class C stream to the Protection of Waters Regulatory Program and hinder forest land owner’s ability to manage their forests and undertake responsible timber harvests. This would add hundreds of miles of marginal streams to this regulatory program and impose windows of limitations on forest management and timber harvesting. By some calculations these windows could span 9 months from October through June, of which winter is preferred harvest season due to frozen conditions.
New York State already has regulations on Class C streams and we have one of the most ambitious water quality protection programs in the country. Our forests make a significant contribution to the protection of streams and other waterbodies throughout the State. New York State also has a Voluntary Best Management Practices for Water Quality guide for forestry which requires foresters and loggers to implement a comprehensive suite of management measures for the protection of streams and water bodies. These streams also already are afforded protection from point and non-point discharges under existing State law and regulations and have requirements under law and regulation for stream crossings.

DEC’s water quality professionals classify streams throughout New York and need to have priorities for processing permits on critical waterways and not use up limited resources available for less pressing matters. Where warranted class C streams can by regulation get the trout (T) designation and added protection. Adding this additional classification will burden not only the Department but forest land owners who, when faced with additional regulations, may choose to not steward their forests.

New York’s forests are under assault from invasive pests and diseases, over browsing from deer and a lack of age diversification which is critical to wildlife. Our forests are already under performing in regards to regeneration and if we expect to have the environmental benefits they afford society as well as the economic benefits of a healthy forest economy we need active forest management. This legislation would serve to discourage sustainable forest management rather than encourage it.

For these reasons, ESFPA cannot support this legislation. This revised memorandum surpasses and replaces any earlier memorandum or communication we have had on this legislation.

Cc: Assembly Environmental Conservation Committee Members
    Assembly Ways and Means Committee Members
    Senate Environmental Conservation Committee Members
    Senate Rules Committee Members

For more information contact:

John K. Bartow, Jr.
Executive Director
Empire State Forest Products Association
47 Van Alstyne Drive
Rensselaer, NY 12144
Tel (518) 436-1297
Cell (518) 573-1441
jbartow@esfpa.org